From the Editor

Articles:

Research On Voice Productions
Howard B. Rothman 5

From Diverse Traditions:
An Appeal to Hazzanim

Improving Experiences With The Volunteer Synagogue Choir
Eugene D. Rosner 13

Nusach Notes
Max Wohlberg 25

Leitmotifs in the Sephardic High Holy Day Liturgy
Maxine R. Kanter 33

Recollections of Early Years of the Cantors Assembly West Coast Region, 1947-1956
Julius Blackman 53

Review Section:

The Golden Age of Cantors: Masterpieces of the Synagogue
Robert S. Scherr 58

Yamim Noraim, Volumes I and II
Murray E. Simon 60
FROM THE EDITOR

This issue of the Journal of Synagogue Music represents an unusual variety of articles on a broad array of subjects. The reader may begin with Howard Rothman's fascinating inquiry into the technical aspects of vocal production of hazzanim and other artists. Dr. Rothman’s article really serves primarily to begin the questioning and gathering of information. We look forward to learning about his conclusions at a later date.

Eugene Rosner’s suggestions on how to work most effectively with a volunteer synagogue choir are bound to be helpful in considering repertoire and rehearsal and performance practices for hazzanim and choir directors.

Max Wohlberg’s ruminations on Nusach reveal once again the encyclopedic recall of one of the great hazzanic sages of our era. Readers can also look forward to the next issue of the Journal, which will be devoted to articles contributed in honor of Hazzan Wohlberg’s 85th birthday by some of those who have been touched by his teaching and personality.

Maxine Ranter’s examination of the use of Leitmotifs in the high holiday liturgy of the Sephardim will provide an in-depth view of that subject which is not only fascinating, but also timely for the quincentennary being observed around the world.

And Julius Blackman’s recollections of the early days of the Cantors Assembly on the west coast provide anecdotal material to be treasured by those who participated as well as those who will want to preserve this record for the future.

Finally, our reviews consider something old and something new: Robert Scherr examines the music book/cassette set The Golden Age of Cantors, while Murray Simon takes a look at the new two volume anthology of High Holiday Music published by Transcontinental Music. Thanks to Robert Scherr for taking on the role of Review Editor. Future items for review may be sent directly to Hazzan Scherr at Temple Israel of Natick, 145 Hartford Street, Natick, Massachusetts 01760.

This issue of the Journal lacks a Music Section. There is plenty of music included in the articles, but readers who miss having this feature are
encouraged to send items (original pieces are particularly welcome) to me at the Editorial address: Congregation Tiferetb Israel, 1354 East Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43205. Ready-to-publish materials are preferred, but we do have some resources available for music copying.

-Jack Chomsky
RESEARCH ON VOICE PRODUCTIONS FROM DIVERSE TRADITIONS: AN APPEAL TO HAZZANIM

HOWARD B. ROTHMAN

The research program that is described below derived from my professional interests involving perception and the acoustic analysis of speech and voice and from several erroneous assumptions. For approximately ten years I have been conducting perceptual and acoustic research on the voice of opera singers. Perceptually, the intent was to determine if listeners have an auditory concept of specific tonal qualities and movements, if there is a consensus of opinion as to that concept, and if listeners can consistently categorize the different vocal productions. Acoustically, the intent was to specify the nature and extent of the parameters comprising vocal tones and movements and to determine if any measured parameters could be identified that influenced the perceptual judgments. For example, if a group of listeners separated two voice samples into the categories good and bad vibrato, or into the categories open and covered tones, would certain acoustic parameters be identified and measured that also differentiated the samples?

The erroneous assumptions derived from my long-term love of hazzanut, from many years of listening to the historical recordings of the “golden age” hazzanim and from many years of living in the Jewish galut of North Central Florida, far away from any center of Jewish culture and far away from the possibility of interacting with any contemporary hazzanim. My assumptions were that some hazzanim sing for many hours without benefit of amplification, use a great deal of coloratura and vocal ornaments (such as trills), sometimes without any food or water and seem to go on for years without experiencing any vocal difficulties.

I have been enlightened, at least partially! Hazzanim do not appear to be supermen and many do experience the same vocal problems that all singers experience. Some questions still remain. Were the “golden age” star hazzanim like Rosenblatt, Hershman, Sirotta, Chagy, etc. supermen? Or did they experience the same problems that Peerce, Pavarotti, etc., experience? Does vocal style/tradition have any influence/impact on a

DR. HOWARD B. ROTHMAN is a Professor in the Department of Communication Processes and Disorders of the Institute for the Advanced Study of Communication Processes at the University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida.
hazzan’s long-term vocal health? Do hazzanim reflect the same aesthetics as do opera singers in terms of their vocal behaviors? To answer these and other questions, I am developing a program of research to compare voice productions deriving from diverse traditions.

The human voice can be the most responsive, flexible and infinitely variable sound producing instrument. When used by the artistic level singer of opera, lied, popular/folk music or liturgical music, it is the most thrilling of all instruments and represents the human voice at its highest level of achievement. Even so, the physiology of voice production and the acoustic parameters that comprise the signal are not completely understood, despite a vast literature extending from the work of Manuel Garcia in the 1850’s to the present. Further, we know that there are differential standards of vocal beauty, effectiveness or aesthetic preference because we are moved by the exceptional sounds produced by a premier singer. However, we do not know what is common or different in these standards within or between diverse ethnic groups.

The art of voice production in singing is a learned behavior derived from different traditions. The effects of a given tradition on a practitioner are strong enough to enable a listener to identify the tradition. Miller (1977) describes differences in English, French, German and Italian styles. Smith et al (1967) have described an unusual mode of chanting produced by Tibetan Lamas. But even the relatively untrained listener can hear differences between, for example, Western-trained, North African and Chinese singers as well as others who are producing traditional styles of vocalizations.

Jews, as a group, are comprised of individuals from many different countries and cultures. Their cultural affiliations have, for the most part, remained intact (Cohen and Katz, 1968). In her introductory remarks during the 1978 World Congress on Jewish Music, M. Smoira Cohen indicated that research on Jewish music is concentrated in two major centers: the United States and Israel, with Israel providing leadership in ethnomusicological research that is attempting to describe the chants and melodies of different ethnic communities gathered in Israel from the Diaspora. Various scholars (Bruno Neal, Simha Arom, Amnon Shiloah, Dahlia Cohen and Ruth Katz), in their presentations at the 1978 Congress, discussed the need for safeguarding the continued existence of oral traditions before homogenization sets in, for collecting materials, diffusion and research. Professor Nettl emphasizes the importance of research as “the continued existence of centuries-old musical traditions hang in the balance.” If they are not preserved, they will disappear over time. Rosenbaum (1985) tells of the concern of the eminent hazzan David Kusevitsky for the preservation of hazzanut:
Where will they hear the sound of the authentic traditional hazzanut which we inherited from the burned-out world of Eastern Europe, if not from those of us who escaped? In past generations there were hundreds of European-trained hazzanim serving countless generations where you could hear-where you could almost feel and touch the sounds of the nusach of Jewish prayer. Today, these hazzanim and their synagogues have almost disappeared.

Current research on the singing voice is attempting to bring scientific objectivity and discipline to a tradition based on subjectivity and individual biases. An understanding of the physiology of exceptional voice productions and its acoustic manifestations is necessary in order to help understand the parameters comprising various vocal styles, to help in the development of better training methodologies, to devise methods for recognizing vocal problems, to develop techniques for vocal rehabilitation, and for prolonging singers’ careers. Fortunately, the attributes of voice that convey beauty, emotion, distress or illness are now quantifiable by means of modern techniques in sound analysis.

There is general agreement that the golden age of hazzanut existed in parts of Russia, Poland, Lithuania and Hungary up to World War II. During the war, the major centers of this cantorial tradition were destroyed and many of its practitioners were killed. Some survived and fled, primarily to the United States and Israel. Many cantors in Israel who serve European-based congregations carry on the Eastern European style of vocal production in their singing of the liturgy. On the other hand, singers in the United States who become cantors are most often trained in a Western, operatic style of vocal production. Therefore, the quality of the sound they produce is different from that of Eastern European cantors and they do (may?) not utilize the range of tonal movements employed by Eastern European-trained cantors. For example, recordings of cantors who had careers in Odessa, Warsaw and Berditchev exhibit tonal movements ranging from straight tone through various kinds of vibrati and trills. A recent study by Shipp and Hakes (1985) examined characteristics of vibrato and trill. In order to find subjects capable of producing various kinds of trills, Shipp and Hakes used singers trained to sing music of the Renaissance and Baroque periods since different trills served as vocal ornaments within those styles and is not commonly found in music of later periods. Should Shipp, located in San Francisco and Hakes, located in New York, have utilized local hazzanim as subjects?

Recorded samples of cantors performing in an Eastern European style have been characterized by non-Jewish singers and vocal pedagogues in the United States as “singing in the back of the throat” and as being “tight”
and “constricted.” Yet these cantors sing with great facility and agility, have a large range, utilize coloratura and trills and sing a full synagogue service lasting two to three hours or more. Singers from Yemen, Morocco and other North African/Middle Eastern countries are perceived as being different from both European and Western trained cantors and singers. These differences may be laryngeal, supra-laryngeal or both.

**PURPOSE**

The primary purpose of this study is to analyze perceptually and acoustically vocal movements and tones used by cantors trained in European, North African/Middle Eastern and Western opera traditions. Perceptually, the intent is to determine 1) if listeners have an auditory concept of specific tonal qualities and movements, 2) if there is a consensus of opinion as to that concept and 3) if listeners can categorize the different vocal productions as deriving from one of the above traditions/styles.

Acoustically, the intent is to specify the nature and extent of the parameters comprising vocal tones and movements and to determine what differences occur in these parameters when produced from singers from the different traditions/styles. Specifics to be examined include the following:

1) Distribution of energy and relative amplitude of voiced harmonics. Differences between harmonics will affect voice quality and will reflect differences in open, covered and constricted tones (Rothman, Nielsen, Hicks, 1980).

2) The singing formant. The singing formant is an area of maximized acoustic energy. Its presence is said to provide brilliance and additional amplitude to the voice (Sundbury, 1977). Production of the singing formant requires a lowered lamyx and a relatively open pharynx just superior to the larynx. It is found in many Western trained opera singers. Do cantors from other traditions have a singing formant?

3) Vocal vibrato and trill. In the Western tradition, a perfectly controlled vibrato is perceptually viewed as indicating a laryngeal system in good health and functioning properly. Deviations from vibrato, called tremolo or wobble, are indicative of a poorly functioning system. Further, changes in vibrato from
Deviations from vibrato, called tremolo or wobble, are indicative of a poorly functioning system. Further, changes in vibrato from one generation to another indicate a change in aesthetics. For example, Seashore (1938) measured the vibrato pulsation rates of some of the great singers of his and earlier times. He reported vibrato pulsation rates ranging from 5.9 to 7.8 pulses per second (pps). Rothman, Neilsen and Hicks (1979) and Shipp, Leanderson and Sundberg (1979) reported pulsation rates ranging from 4.9 to 6 pps. The slower pulse rates current today represent a shift in our aesthetic value system. Acoustic analyses of samples acquired from live and archival recordings will provide information as to whether Eastern European and North African cantors follow the same or different aesthetic systems than Western trained singers and if these aesthetic systems are stable or changing. Sustained unaccompanied (i.e., a cappella) segments will be recorded “live” and from historical recordings for acoustics and perceptual analyses in order to determine what stylistic changes have occurred during the past sixty-plus years. Acoustic analyses will provide information as to differences or similarities between vocal movements resulting from the different traditions. Further, by comparing the vocal productions deriving from different traditions, information will be acquired concerning different learned behaviors and how they might affect the teaching process and the singing activity itself.

**SIGNIFICANCE**

Vocal pedagogy, wherever it is practiced, is a highly subjective art. Vocal pedagogues, singers, voice scientists and otolaryngologists have difficulty in specifying the differences between a good, healthy vibrato and other tonal movements or between various tones other than through subjective auditory processing. Quantifying differences in the parameters comprising vocal movements and tones through acoustic analyses and classifying them into different categories through perceptual tests will clarify some of the confusion. The ultimate goal of this program of research, along with past and, hopefully, future research, is to understand the nature of the exceptional sounds that provide pleasure to so many. If we can understand what constitutes a good healthy voice, we can determine when changes occur indicating a change in physiologic use or a vocal mechanism beginning to break down. The ability to identify and or describe changes in a performer’s vocal output or the ability to identify
the incipient stages of a vocal mechanism in trouble will enable rehabilitation to begin at an earlier stage than usual so that a career can be maintained for longer periods of time.

It would be most helpful if hazzanim who read this would be willing to share their recordings with me, recordings of themselves or of any other hazzanim in their collections. The recordings could be LP's, CD’s, cassettes or reel-to-reel formats. Of particular interest are recordings of anyone that span a number of years so that changes in vocal behaviors over time can be examined and measured. To paraphrase Mordechai Yardeini: The value of a good, tasteful, serious Jewish song is incalculable.

REFERENCES


Rothman, H.B., Nielsen, K. and Hicks, J., Perceptual Classifications of Voice Movements, Proceedings of the Eighth Symposium: Care of the


Slobin, M., *Chosen Voices: The Story of the American Cantorate, 11*


IMPROVING EXPERIENCES WITH THE
VOLUNTEER SYNAGOGUE CHOIR

EUGENE D. ROSNER

With the wealth of synagogue choral music in existence, it behooves a cantor to form and engage a synagogue choir. The resources of a modest-sized synagogue will often include a number of qualified singers after a rough recruitment from the membership list is made. These singers may not have the powerful voices possessed by professionals but their pleasant voices and suitable ears can be trained in a manner which will yield a nice sound. The leader of the group can rely on the balance of sound and good musicianship. A dozen or so singers can do justice to some fine choral works. The volunteer synagogue choir is an important institution.

The idea that a choir is composed of a synagogue’s membership is valuable and not to be taken lightly. In fact, it is something on which many synagogues pride themselves. The virtues of professional versus volunteer choirs must be weighed. While the sound of a professional choir will undoubtedly be finer, the question of who is singing adds an emotional twist. Somehow, knowing that your congregants are producing the music being heard adds to the psychological impact of the music. On the average, lay volunteers work much harder to be a part of their synagogue service. This fact is irrefutable. The volunteer choir is an institution that is indeed relatively easy to form and nurture, but there is a responsibility to maintain its music-making abilities and in fact, improve them. The growth of the group will be noticed by the congregation. More importantly, the individual members of the choir who recognize their progress will be inspired and will continue to support the endeavor.

What are the ingredients that make up a successful choral singing program?

Because music, in the eyes of music lovers is fun, a choir is perhaps more easily formed than an average synagogue committee. A choir meets to sing, an activity which is said to provide emotional and physical release. Rehearsals are, for the most part, scheduled at night after a day of work. Your singers might be tired, but they have come to sing and perhaps socialize a little. But when it comes down to it, the main reason they are

EUGENE D. ROSNER is Hazzan of Temple Beth Hillel/Beth El of Wynnewood, Pennsylvania.
there is to make music. Hopefully, after rehearsal, they will return home with the positive feeling that they have accomplished something very meaningful and be inspired for the next time they meet. The operative word here is “inspiration.” Challenge your choir! They can do more than they or you realize.

Example 1

In the first example, a setting of V’hakonim by Paul Discount, there is a vast opportunity for unison singing. Contrary to first impression, this type of singing presents a variety of problems. A missed note in a harmonized selection might go unnoticed. A missed note in unison singing can easily stick out like a sore thumb. Entrances and cadences have to be scrutinized as well, since the focus is on the melodic line. The weight of music-making now falls on the phrasing of melody. Breath and dynamic contrasts come to the fore and now become a necessary part of the piece.
The antiphonal nature of this piece presents more challenges. At the end of the second line, the choir must sense the E-Bat from the cantor’s F. A measure later, the choir breaks into two octaves (or three, depending on your interpretation). Balance here is very important. Moments later we are back in unison; the intensity of the descending line must be felt by the listener. The melismatic quality of the choirs first entrance climaxes at Hayu Korim with four-part harmony. This piece has several shifts of mood and all of them must be recognized by the conductor and subsequently conveyed to and by the singers for the music to be effective. The remote key and low notes of the bass can add an air of mystique to this highlight of the Avodah Service.

A completely different but equally challenging work for choir would be something along the lines of our next example, Hayom T'amzenu by Max Helfman.

Example 2
Much choral music is written in homorhythmic style. This saves the choir undue worry over not singing together. The singers only have to master one rhythm and do not have to be concerned with combining different rhythms at any given moment. The **challenge** here (and the resulting payoff) is the way the music moves from one key to another. By a basic vehicle of secondary dominance, the piece constantly moves but does not stray too far. With **the** exception of the bass line, each part is of interest and can stand on its own. Cries of “the sopranos always get the melody” are somewhat vanquished here. But of course, some of these lines are difficult. In Example 3, opportunities arise for concertino singing where male and female voices are featured.

Example 3
This along with the *amen* (Example 4) involve chromatic elements.

**Example 4**

![Musical notation]

Intonation becomes a focal point of rehearsal time. I have found that making part tapes (I use falsetto for soprano and alto parts) and handing them out with the music before the first run-through is invaluable. Once the members of the choir realize that you are quite serious about your intentions, as well as your aspirations, they will likely answer the call and put in the practice time. They will come to rehearsals and be surprised at what they have accomplished.

Along with the ambitious qualities of a choral conductor come the more realistic ones. What will keep my choir interested? A series of difficult pieces can bum singers out through frustration and not achieving certain goals. Bring music that’s enjoyable to sing. This should not be in conflict with my first statement. In fact, it is complementary. Music that is easy to sing will often not be inspiring. The need to challenge must be addressed but it is important for all to be able to see the light at the end of the tunnel. Our previous example illustrated the need for all singers to enjoy the parts they sing. When a composer sets out to arrange a melody, a typical approach is to give the melody to the soprano, introduce a moving bass line and fill the chords out in alto and tenor. The most perplexed singers in choirs are members of these last two sections, and with good
reason. Example 5 below shows what can be done in the simplest of seuings.

Example 5

Evening Service for the Day of Atonement

Yaa’leh

\[\text{Music notation image here}\]

\[\text{Translation image here}\]
Again, some intervals are difficult (last two measures in alto) but the richness of the tightly packed voice, the opposite moving parts in soprano and bass make for a powerful sound. The suspension in bar 3 is a marvelous, timeless moment. As we guide our prayers up to heaven on the night of Yom Kippur, tell your choir members the meaning of Yaaleh and how it manifests itself in the form of the soprano’s melody. Beimel must have had the sequence D-F#, D-G, D-A, D-Bb in mind. Each singer will react in a special way to this idea. The relationship between voice and word will reach new meaning, and the choir as the cantor’s “m’shor’rim” will play an important role for some. If the parts are memorized, the singers can be encouraged to sing out of their Machzorim where new words are substituted on each new line of this piyyut. The piece can obviously be done several times. The choir will welcome these strophic settings.

The basses in the choir have an important role as well. It is indeed crucial to keep their spirits and pitches high. The pieces shown in Examples 6 and 7 each give the bass a sense of responsibility.

Example 6
In this work by Naumbourg, the bass establishes one of the motives which is then emulated by soprano and alto in thirds. *A dolce* the bass has an ostinato figure which characterizes his role in music even more so. In this purely musical style (typical of European synagogue music in the mid-19th century) as opposed to a programmatic or a liturgically-related style, the bass is given a charming solo at the end, one that any singer will covet. The piece has some other notable features which should come to the attention of the conductor. Soprano and tenor continually have an interplay of a dotted rhythm. The high tessitura of the tenor line can be dealt with by a transposition. An effort should be made to make a contrast between the two measures of V'et haaretz. Much can be done with the long thirds duet for the entire ensemble. The sudden four-part writing at the duet’s end is fine and the sudden pianissimo B-minor chord at Vayinafash is an important mood change and should be worked on until its effect is felt by all the singers.

Example 7
The Greenberg piece also has opportunities where pairs of parts (S/T), (A/B) play off each other. The melody in thirds is by now a familiar, effective and even irresistible device in writing. It is also not hard for choir and is readily enjoyed by the participants. Alto and bass have countersubjects that give them the opportunity to shine. It is imperative that when one looks at music for potential choral use that it be examined with the singers in mind. What will spark their interest? What will they enjoy?

A choir that grows musically will flourish. Periodic announcements in the synagogue bulletin inviting people to join will help the choir grow in numbers. It is always a desire to have more members to obtain, among other things, a fuller sound.

Recruit singers from obvious sources! Taking an active role in synagogue functions shows your interest in the welfare of your synagogue as a whole. In return, your congregants are likely to reciprocate if they are approached on their ground, be it a Sisterhood meeting or a Men’s Club breakfast. A shabbat service with your ears attuned to the congregation will expose previously unheard voices. A compliment like “I really heard you singing along” can start the proceedings. Our young students are special. Besides representing our future, our Bar/Bat Mitzvah students
keep us young. We even establish a fine rapport with a few gifted and caring students now and then. The solo shown in Example 8 can be sung by a boy alto, a stylistic return to the past.

Example 8

I’ve experimented with tenor and bass humming “ah” in supporting the soloist. At molto rallantando, the alto and tenor can really enjoy the progression between the third and fourth beats before the second verse.

Think of your choir as year-round. In many synagogues the quantum leap from High Holy Day to year round is not so hard to implement. As we come full circle, the idea of inspiration resurfaces again. A choir that sings only in the fall, and whose members have fixed in their minds a rigid set of rehearsal dates will not be inclined to learn new music or to rehearse earlier in the spring. Forming a core of music lovers to sing year-round opens many doors and allows for practically endless possibilities. Being in good communication with your group is of paramount importance. Sending out reminders of choir rehearsals and telling them what to bring will make your singers feel respected and needed. Preparing special events and giving your choir an occasion to look forward to is an incentive. Consider using your choir to introduce new
congregational tunes on shabbat. The fact that a dozen people know a new piece from the start makes the piece more viable. Other possibilities include supplying works by one composer and whole service material in one style. *Shabbat Nusach S'fard* by Rosenberg and *Chassidic Service* by Davidson are examples. These become learning experiences for choir and congregation alike. Announcing events such as these well in advance and even previewing them with articles will result in a larger congregation to listen to you and to give your singers the sense of honor they need to continue on in this wonderful service that they can provide to themselves and your congregation.
NUSACH NOTES

Max Wohlberg

I am frequently asked for a definition or meaning of the term Nusach. My usual response is that it is the generally accepted manner of chanting our liturgy. Sometimes I add that this manner does not necessarily hold true for every country and every region.

When pressed for greater detail I endeavor to explain the musical modes utilized during the various services and mention the "Misinai" tunes employed. If pressed further I point to the cantorial recitative as an embellishment of the simple chant versus the more elementary congregational tune or response. We rarely reach the stage of discussing choral compositions or organ solos.

However, in fact, upon close analysis of our nusach repertoire we discover in it a more minute structural element; short melodic phrases which may occur with frequent regularity.

These brief melodic phrases are, as a rule, absorbed by Ba' alei Tfillah and regular synagogue attendants. I am thus often delighted to hear an untrained officiant on a Sabbath morning chant:

Example 1

He wilt also repeat the motif for v'ne-eman ala. (Example 2)

Example 2

MAX WOHLBERG is Nathan Cummings Professor of Hazzanut at the Jewish Theological Seminary.
Such brief motifs may be found at different parts of our liturgy.

Take for example, this simple motif:

Example 3

\[ I \]

I have encountered it in such places as at the end of the Hoshana service (Example 4) and at the conclusion of the Hallel (Example 5).

Example 4

\[ L'ma-an-da- at KI o-mi \ ha-a- rets KI A-dornai hu \ ha-c-la-hk eim- Od. \]

Example 5

\[ KI l'kha tov l'Ho-dot, urshim-bna nach l'kameir KI mei-o-ham rad o-lam at-a- eil. \]

Actually you can also hear it in the prayer after the ceremony of circumcision (if chanted by a knowledgeable person):

Example 6

\[ Yis-mah ha-a- ve-tei ha-la-tsaw, v'ta-til imo, biffi, vit-nah. \]
When, during that prayer, a few drops of wine are passed to the baby’s lips, you will hear...

Example 7

![Musical notation](image)

A careful examination of the tunes we employ will reveal interesting details. We meet exclusive tunes which are attached to one specific text: The Kol Nidrei for example, and the Aleinu for the High Holydays. We also encounter texts which utilize many tunes, such as Yigdal, Kaddish, Barchu, etc.

We discover that many tunes begin alike but will end differently while others begin differently but end similarly. We also encounter some tunes in unexpected places.

Take, for example Tair Vetaria (Example 1091) [all the following example numbers refer to A. Baer’s Ba-al Tefilah].

Example 1091

![Musical notation](image)

As expected, similar passages consisting of three short phrases followed by Kadosh will use this tune. (See also examples 1095, 1097, 1098.)

Example 1095

![Musical notation](image)

Example 1097

![Musical notation](image)
It is nonetheless surprising to find this tune during the four special Sabbaths (Shekalim).

One of the most distinctive and impressive elements of the Yom Kippur service is the Avodah. During it the V’hakohanim (Example 1442) is chanted.

But you will also hear at least part of this tune in the K’dusha (Example 1198). And, unexpectedly, on Shabbat Shekalim.
To attempt to justify the appearance of these High Holiday tunes at other occasions, such as in the examples I have given above (Examples 659, 657) is no easy matter. Let me at least venture one plausible explanation, in the first you find the word Rosh, in the second, Kippurim. Perhaps these words were sufficient to justify employing these tunes. I challenge my readers to unearth other reasons.

One of the most frequently encountered tunes, in whole or in part is (Example 1101).

Example 1101

See also Examples 1158, 1093.

Example 1158

Example 1093

Its practically identical appearance you will find in the Shacharit of Yom Kippur (Example 1368).

Example 1368
A fascinating view is represented by the following three examples:

Example 1033

Example 852

Example 1188

While they all begin the same way they all end differently.
Now let us look at three examples that have different beginnings:

Example 1311

Minhag Polen.

Solo. **dann Chor.**

Example 1311 - 2W

Example 1311 - 1W

Solo, **dann Chor.**

Example 1407 v.3
As you see, they conclude the same way as Example 1033 above did.

To offer just one more example of this exciting phenomenon I will point to the popular Ata Hareita tune for Simhat Torah.

Example 918

How surprising it is to hear it at the Musaf of Yom Kippur!

Example 145 1

A close study of this subject—alas a neglected task, reveals many surprises and affords a fascinating view of the melodies which have become “traditional” in our synagogues.

Regrettably many of these tunes are disappearing from our repertoire since their texts have been removed. Fortunately, Charles Davidson has successfully transplanted a number of them to retained texts, thus saving them from extinction.

Hopefully some of our younger colleagues will decide to launch serious studies of this subject. The recent efforts of Davidson, Brian J. Mayer and Boaz Tarsi augur well and hold out much promise for the future of such studies.
LEITMOTIFS IN SEPHARDIC HIGH HOLY DAY LITURGY

MAXINE R. KANTER

The Jews of Spain and Portugal—the original Sephardim—developed over many centuries their own unique and very beautiful form of religious worship. Their services were enhanced by the addition of poetry for special occasions such as the major festivals and the Yamim Noraim (High Holy Days). Most of these poetic insertions are rhymed, metrical hymns (piyyutim) and were the products of the great literary figures of the Golden Age of the Jews in Spain (c. 950-1150), such as ibn Gabril, Haleiv and the two ibn Ezras.

Following the Edict of Expulsion in 1492, Spanish Jews who did not accept conversion to Catholicism were faced with the loss of all their property and virtual deportation. Many fled to nearby lands where they believed they would be safe and perhaps, their exile would be temporary. Those who settled around the Mediterranean basin (Turkey, Greece, North Africa, Palestine, etc.), are known to us as “Eastern” or Levantine Sephardim. They are remarkable in the Sephardic Diaspora in that they carried their language, liturgy, and customs with them and have maintained these uninterrupted until this day.

Other Sephardim, principally those who had crossed over from Spain into Portugal—only to discover five years later that the long and menacing arm of the Inquisition had pursued them even to that supposedly welcoming haven—escaped, if they were lucky, to France, Holland, and other countries in Northern Europe and, eventually, the New World. This second group, often referred to by their contemporaries as “Portuguese merchants” because of their close identification with commercial enterprises, included many Marranos or “secret Jews” who were outwardly practicing Catholics. As a consequence, these crypto-Jews were not as steadfast or fortunate in being able to preserve their Jewish traditions. For the ex-Marranos, then, the forced change of identity necessitated more of a reintroduction than a return to mainstream Judaism. This accounts for the differences between the “Eastern”

MAXINE R. KANTER holds a Ph.D. in Music History and Literature from Northwestern University. She has lectured widely on Sephardic History and Culture as well as Opera and has taught at Sparta College and the University of Illinois.
Sephardim and the “Western.” In addition, the effects of acculturation in the various host countries of their dispersion played a significant role in shaping the two main branches of the Sephardic family.

As a general overview, however, both traditions of synagogue song share these common traits:

1. **Oral transmission.** Not until the middle of the 19th century were the chants written down. Continuity was assured by strict adherence to custom. However, in the event certain hymns or prayers had no tradition tune, the hazzan, not unlike the medieval bards or minnesingers, was permitted to select or invent one of his own. This resulted in a large number of melodies for a few well-known hymns such as *Ein Kelohenu, Yigdal, Adon Olam, Lekhah Dodi*, etc. Conversely the extreme sanctity of the High Holy Days, although embellished with piyyutim, is imbued with such somber soul-searching that it would discourage any attempts at entertainment or novelty on the part of the hazzan.

2. Use of repetition, Sephardic chants are often made up of short motivic figures which are linked together and repeated again and again—or varied somewhat—in order to fit the text. This method of musical composition corresponds generally to an Oriental style and probably dates from ancient, or, at least, pre-Expulsion times. The disaffection and impatience with this body of music often expressed by non-Sephardim may be attributed to this type of musical construction, but it has a special quality and deep meaning for all Sephardic Jews.

3. **Absence of melancholy or mournful expression.** Despite

---


the penitent or pleading nature of many of the liturgical texts, Sephardic music often reflects a joyful and vigorous character. Unlike that of the Ashkenazim, Sephardic liturgy contains few laments and, in the rhymed and metrical pieces, the rhythms are strong and well-defined. Among the Western Sephardim, in particular, the tunes are frequently based on the scale patterns found in the music of Northern and Western Europe.

4. Use of local popular or folk-tunes. This practice is found not only in Sephardic music, but, unquestionably, in the repertoires of the Ashkenazim and Christian communities as well. (Martin Luther is reputed to have asked, “Why should we leave all the good tunes for the devil?”) Many a folksong has been transformed into a synagogue song, regardless of its origin or apparent suitability. Some of the early hazzanim, who were also poets (paytanim), cleverly constructed contrafacts, new poetic texts to fit a popular melody, imitating the meter, rhyme and phonetics of the original secular text. No doubt the congregation enjoyed singing the familiar and well-loved melody, but rabbinic literature of the time reveals a serious concern over the use of inappropriate secular songs, even with substitute religious texts.

Unfortunately, there exists no record or musical evidence of the tunes that were adopted for synagogue use, although de Sola cites several examples of Spanish popular melodies by name.

5. Use of tune as a representative musical theme or “leitmotiv.” During an important holiday or season, one melody is heard often and carries the association of the special day(s). Thus, throughout the High Holy Days a melody closely related to a key poem or prayer is adapted also for their implementation under the rubric “Sing to themelody (lahan) of . ..” followed by the incipit of a well-known Hebrew or Arabic song are to be


found in many old manuscripts. To this day, as we shall see, prayerbooks in the Sephardic rite carry these musical clues. (This was not only practical as a reminder to the congregation which melody was to be used, but it discouraged which melody was to be used, but it discouraged an ambitious [or forgetful?] hazzan from introducing a tune of his own choosing at this point in the service.

THE DUTCH AND ENGLISH TRADITION

The oral tradition of synagogue music became crystallized among the Portuguese Jews who settled in Holland after that country freed itself from Spain in the late 16th century. Their customs, the order of service, and the musical practices of the Amsterdam Synagogue and the slightly younger London congregation were originally the same, as they remained in very close contact, the Dutch community usually providing the rabbis and hazzanim for both, as well as for the “daughter” congregations overseas. However, it was not until 1857, when a collection of liturgical tunes of the Spanish and Portuguese ritual was published, that a document containing substantial musical material became available and could then be circulated among the affiliated congregations in an effort to fill and preserve their repertoire.

This valuable cornerstone of Sephardic musical history, The Ancient Melodies of the Spanish and Portuguese Jews, consisted of melodies transcribed and harmonized by Emanuel Aguilar (1824-1904). but the selection of the tunes and their placement in the liturgical order was undoubtedly made by David de Sola, hazzan from 1818 until his death in 1860 of Sahar Asamaim, the Spanish and Portuguese Jews’ Congregation at Bevis Marks in London.

De Sola, born December 26, 1796 in Amsterdam, was the only son of Aaron and Sarah Namias Torres de Sola. highly educated and observant Jews who traced their family origins to pre-Expulsion Spain and, later, to Holland and England. Although initially his knowledge of English was

5. The term lahan was adopted by the Jews from the Arabic. See Hanoch Avenary. “Music,” Encyclopedia Judaica, XII. P. 595.
slight, he learned very quickly and soon mastered the language well enough to publish his first work, “The Blessings,” with an English translation in 1829. In the same year, he preached the first English sermon ever heard in the Portuguese synagogue, religious discourses having been infrequent and invariably delivered in the Spanish or Portuguese languages.

In 1840 de Sola issued a prospectus for a new edition of the Sacred Scriptures, with critical and explanatory notes. The first (and only) volume, containing also a brief history of former translations, appeared in 1844 and was considered to be a valuable literary production, being republished shortly afterwards in Germany. However, it is The Ancient Melodies that remains de Sola’s greatest literary contribution, not only because of his collaboration in this first attempt at notating and authenticating the sacred music legacy of this branch of Jewry, but for the English translations of many of their hymns and a memorable early venture into the uncharted waters of Jewish Music scholarship, his “Historical Essay” which prefaces the collection.

In attempting to date the creation of the melodies given in his anthology, de Sola suggests three chronological divisions: 1) prior to the settlement of the Jews in Spain; 2) during their long sojourn on the Iberian Peninsula; 3) “a later date” [i.e., after the Sephardic dispersion]. Although he states in his Preface that “very probably many chants used on the Festival of the New Year and Day of Atonement [belong to the first class],” he seems to contradict himself by placing all of the twelve High Holy Day tunes except one in the category, evenly dividing the examples:

6. The Iberian languages were still the vernaculars employed in the Sephardic community of London in the first half of the nineteenth century, and all of its written records were kept in Portuguese.

six are for Rosh Ha-Shauna and six for Yom Kippur. § Ten out of the twelve are forpiyyutim. These include Ahot Ketannah, Shofet Kol Ha-aretz, Yah Shimkha, Et Sha-arei Ratzon, Adonai Bekol Shofar, Shema Koli.

8. The hymn collection consists of six categories: “Morning Hymns,” “Sabbath Melodies and Hymns,” “For Feast of New Year and Day of Atonement,” “Festival Hymns,” “Elegies for the Ninth Day of Ab,” and “Occasional Hymns.” Nos. 26 to 36 are for the High Holy Days. No. 70, Rahem Na Ala, (“Dirge for the Dead”) has also been included in this study as the melody is also used for Gabirol’s Elohim Eli Attah for the morning of the Day of Atonement, and is the tune de Sola regards as being “composed at a later date. “Historical Essay,” p. 16.

9. “The Little Sister,” by Abraham Gerondi. Author’s notation taken from Aguilar’s transcription. All hymn notations given in musical examples are from The Ancient Melodies unless otherwise identified. Example 1.

10. “Sovereign Judge of all the Earth,” by unknown poet. It was formerly attributed to Solomon ibn Gabirol, probably because of a name acrostic which reads SheLoMoh HaZaK (“Solomon, be strong”), but none of the anthologies or biographies of Gabirol mention this poem. Example 2a is a photographic reproduction of Aguilar’s transcription, the only hymn tune given monophonically in the collection. Judging from the extreme ornamentation and melismatic style of the piece, one can conclude that it was a greatpersonal favorite of Hazzan de Sola’s. Example 2b. a more straightforward notation, is taken from the Book of Prayers...I of the Spanish and Portuguese Jews. London: Henry Frowde. 5661-5668/1901-1907, Vol. II.

11. “O Lord, I would extol Their name.” by Yehudah ben Samuel Halevi. considered to be the greatest of all post-Biblical poets. There are more piyyutim in the Sephardic prayerbooks by Halevi than by any other author. Example 3.

12. “When the gates of mercy are opened,” by Judah ben Samuel Abbas. Example 4. Example 5 is a photographic reproduction of the stanza of Et Sha’arei Ratzon as it appears in Sephardi Melodies, Part 2.

13. “God has gone up amidst shouting,” by an unknown paytan named “Jacob.” Example 6.

Anna Be-koren,13 Yah Shema Ebyonekha,16 El Nora Alilah,17 and Elohim Eli Attah.18

The eminent pioneer Jewish ethnomusicologist Abraham Zevi Idelsohn presented a somewhat different dating for the ancient melodies: he suggests a Spanish hallmark for only twenty-three. compared with de Sola’s total of forty-seven,19 but no explanation is given. In fact, neither expert offers criteria or proof for his assessment. Nevertheless, it is impressive that, although they concur on only nineteen musical numbers, nine of them are from the repertoire for the High Holy Days.” That these scholars should be in agreement on nine out of twelve examples given in this classification should not surprise us and only serves to reinforce the theory that, because of the solemnity associated with the High Holy Days, there is a greater tendency to honor and preserve the old tunes at that time.

15. This hymn written by David ben Eleazer ibn Paquda is constructed without a true refrain. From its design it is obvious that the poet meant for it to be performed antiphonally (i.e., after every phrase the hazzan sings, the congregation responds with a short phrase of its own). Inasmuch as it also does not appear as a “representative” theme for the High Holy Days, it has been eliminated from this study.


17. “God of Awe,” by Moses ibn Ezra, despite its position of importance in this religious observance, does not have a melodic relationship with any other text and therefore has been excluded.

18. “0 God, my God art Thou,” by Solomon ibn Gabirol shares its melody with Rahem Na Alav and it is this text that de Sola and Aguilar used in The Ancient Melodies. Example 10.

19. Idelsohn, up. cit.. 515 (No .2).

20. Ibid. Idelsohn and de Sola agree that all the piyyutim except Ahot Ketannah are from the Spanish period. Idelsohn places it at a later date than de Sola does.
LEITMOTIFS FOR THE HIGH HOLY DAYS

It is also not unreasonable to speculate that these same tunes, because of their age and venerability, have not only survived in the Sephardic High Holy Day liturgy, but have become inseparable from the service, where they are heard over and over again. They are often adapted for the piyyutim having refrains (pizmonim), but they may also appear as settings for other texts (Barekhu, Kaddish, Kedushah, etc.) during that season. However, although it is certainly not usual for a melody associated with one event on the Jewish calendar to appear on any other, it is extremely rare in the Sephardic tradition, especially during the Yamin Noraim. On the other hand, a number of tunes are featured often enough to qualify as true holiday leitmotifs. That is: 1) they are unquestionably very old; 2) they convey a strong and immediate reminder of the High Holy Days; 3) they have multiple settings and are heard repeatedly.

The first piyyut sung in the evening service of Rosh Ha-Shana (first night only) is Ahot Ketannah. (Example 1) The hazzan usually repeating the last stanza to the tune of Shofet Kol Ha’aretz (Examples 2a and 2b) and continuing with this melody for the first part of the Kaddish Le’ela which is done on both evenings. At the congregational response Yehe Shemeh Rubbu the melody shifts to that of Yedei Rashim and this is sung to the Barekhu and the Kaddish Titkabal; in Amsterdam it is also used for the Yigdal which concludes the evening service.” [On the second night of

21. See Avenary. *op. cit.*, 595. Avenary traces the development of refrain types to the extensive use of foreign forms such as the shir ezor (“girdle song”), which was probably an ancestor of both the Spanish villancico and the French virelai. It is characterized by a certain order of rhymes and an unchanging refrain (pizmon) to be performed in chorus by the audience.

22. In addition to the Rahem Na Alav already discussed, in the Musaf services for Rosh Ha-Shanah, Hayom Hat-at Olam is sung three times, each time to a different melody. The third setting is set to the same melody as Leshoni Bonanta, a poem from the Passover season.

23. The descriptions of performance practices in the Dutch and English Sephardic congregations which follow are based primarily on the writers’ observations, field work and interviews with community clergy.

24. Ye’i Rashim (“Too feeble and poor”), Yehudah Halevi’s piyyut for the first day of Rosh Ha-Shanah, is set to the same melody as Yah Shimkha. In London and New York they sing Yigdal to the tune of Et Sha’arei Ratzon for the High Holy Days. See Example 5.
Rosh Ha-Shana the **Kaddish** is sung to the Ahot melody, inasmuch as that piece is not recited then.1

Example 1
Example 2b

In the morning service for the first day, following the usual blessings and psalms, the hazzan begins the pizmon Elohai Al Tedineni 25 to the tune of Shema Koli followed by the entire Shofet. [On the second day they sing Adonai Yom Lekha26 to the tune of Shema Koli.] On the first day Kaddish has as introduction Halevi’s Yedei Rashim; for the second day, that poet’s pizmon Yah Shimkha 27 is substituted in its place, both poems- as one would expect-utilizing the same tune, the holiday’s musical theme par

25. “Judge me not, 0 my God,” formerly attributed to Halevi, it is now believed to have been written by Issac bar Levi ben mar Saul Alisani.

26. “Lord, this day,” was written by Yehudah Halevi.

27. Note the error in Aguilar’s transcription of Yah Shimkha (Example 3). He has reversed the words to the refrain and has written that of Yedei Rashim, the first day’s hymn (also by Halevi), instead.
excellence, and one that is very nearly ubiquitous as well. Then the Kaddish is sung to the Yedei Rashim.

Example 3

* Note the text for the refrain given here as in The Ancient Melodies it is actually the refrain from Yedei Rashim, Halevi’s hymn sung the first day. The words (taken from the Kaddish which follows) should be Yishtabah ve-it pa’ar ve-yit romam ve-yit naseh (“Praised be He and glorified, lifted and exalted.”)

After the repetition of the Amidah on the first day they sing Lema-ankha Efhoi 28 to the same melody as Adonai Bekol Shofar, although the imperative “Lahan Lema-ankha” (sing [to] Lema-ankha here) in some of the oldest prayerbooks known gives rise to the question “Which of the two poems received the musical setting first?” Depending upon the answer, a second question might be “Were the two poems, in fact, always sung to the identical melody?”

In place of the above poem for the second day they sing Ya aneh Behor Ahot 29 to the Lema-ankha Adonai Bekol melody. The next poetic

28. “For Thine own sake,” was written by ibn Paquda, who is also known as Pakuda or Bakoda.

29. “For merit of the fathers,” is believed to have been written by Abraham ibn Ezra.
piece, *Et Sha-arei Ratzon*,30 a long, dramatic rendition of the sacrifice of Isaac (the Akdah) is one of the high points in the Sephardic High Holy Day service and is significant also for the role of women in its performance. Because of its subject matter—the near loss of a beloved child—the universal understanding and empathy for maternal grief often produces audible reactions from the women in the congregation, particularly those of Eastern or Oriental origin. Unless Rosh Ha-Shanah falls on the Sabbath (thus omitting the blowing of the shofar), all Sephardic congregations chant *Adonai Bekol Shofar* before the first “sounding of the horn” on the New Year.

Example 4

30. This poem is also sung in Amsterdam after the closing hymn Yigdal on the Eve of Yom Kippur as well as in the Shaharit service on Rosh Ha-Shanah. Perhaps this is a vestige of an older custom. It is also still part of the afternoon service in some communities of North Africa.
LIBRITECHA
END OF NCET SHANCARE RATION.
Sung on New Year.
Example 6

In the Musaf service there are no piyyutim specifically included, but the Amidah and the Kedushah that follows later are both sung to the tune of Lema-ankha or Ahot Ketannah. [On the second day Et Sha-arei Ratzon may be substituted for Lema-ankha.] After the Malkhuyot and the blowing of the shofar the congregation sings Hayom Harat Olam three times: the first is sung to Shafer, the second (after the blessings of the Zikhronot) to Adonai Bekol and, finally, after the Shofarot prayers, to the melody for Leshoni Bonanta, a poem “borrowed” form the festival of Passover and, therefore, a rarity during this holiday. If it is late enough in the day, some selihot can be inserted, otherwise, Ein Kelohenu is sung to the tune of Yedei Rashim and the service concludes (as it does on the Sabbath), except that it is now heard to the tune of Yedei Rashim.

The first hymn for the Eve of Kippur is Shemar Koli. Later, after the Kol Nidrei and other prayers, Ve-Hu Rahum is sung to the tune of Shofet, Barekhu to the tune of Yedei Rashim and they proceed with evening prayers as on the Sabbath. After Tefillah, the pizmon Anna Be-korenu is performed in its characteristic (i.e., antiphonal) manner. Kaddish

31. In some congregations Lekha Eli Teshukati (To you, my God, I desire”) by Abraham ibn Ezra is read before Shema Koli. The next is included in the Book of Prayer... published by the Union of Sephardic Congregations in New York. It is in Hebrew with no English translation. Rabbi David de Sola Pool (a great grandson of Rev. David deSola) was editor and translator of the series and obviously had the congregations of Eastern Sephardim in mind as potential customers for his new edition.
[Titkabbal] is sung to the Yedei rashim and this tune is also used for the Yigdal Elohim Hai which concludes that evening’s service.

Example 7

![Example 7](image)

Example 8a

![Example 8a](image)

Example 8b

![Example 8b](image)

Shema’ Koli (No. 2) is taken from Abraham Lopes Cardozo, “The Music of the Sephardim,” in The World of the Sephardim (Herzl Institute Pamphlet No. 15). New York: Herzl Press, 1960. The hymn is given here with its entire melody. (Aguilar’s transcription, (No. 1) gives only the refrain.)
The first piyyut heard in the morning service of Kippur is *Adonai Negdekha Kol Ta'avit,* sung to the tune of *Shema Koli,* followed directly by *Elohim Eli Attah,* the hymn introducing *Nishmat.* Then *Shin’annim Sha’annim* is heard, yet another setting of the Yedei *Rashim* melody and the Kaddish as in earlier services (i.e., *Ahot Ketannah,* except for Yehe Shemeh *Rabba* and *Barekhu* using *Yedei Rashim*). Following the priestly blessing they sing *Lema-ankha* to its traditional melody, as it is also done on Rosh Ha-Shanah.

32. “Before Thee, 0 Lord, is all my desire” a poem by Yehudah Halevi; does not have a refrain.

33. Sung as in No. 70 of The Ancient Melodies, Rahem NaAlab. See this paper, Example 9.

34. “Radiant Angels of peace,” has an unchallenged authorship; ibn Gabirol’s name is given twice in a name acrostic.

35. *Lema-ankha* is the only piyyut having a firm and long established place in the liturgy for both Rosh Ha-Shanah and Yom Kippur. It is included in all the old prayer books I was able to locate, including the first known to have been printed in Spain, the *Mahzor fe-Yom ha-Kippurim,* [Puebla da Montalban?], 1480, in the collection of the Jewish Theological Seminary in New York.
Compared to the Ashkenazic and Italian rituals, the Musaf insertions of piyyutim in the Sephardic ritual are relatively few in number. *Bimromei Eretz,*36 a hymn to introduce the *Kedushah,* is sung to *Adonai Bekol Shofar* and, later, that melody-or *Ahot Ketannah*—is used for *Keter.* There are several superb piyyutim in the Musaf Abodah which are no longer sung, but the final poetic insertion in this service, *Shamem Har Tziyyon*37 is sung to the *Lema-ankha/Adonai Bekof* melody in all Sephardic communities. After the repetition of the Amidah, *Yisrael Abadekha,*38 sung to the *Yedei Rashim* tune, introduces the *Musaf Selihot,* after which Musaf concludes with *Ein Kelohenu* and *Adon Olam,* both sung to *Yedei Rashim.*

In the repetition of the Amidah during Minhah on Yom Kippur the congregation sings *Benei Elyon*39 to the tune of *Adonai Bekol Shofar* as an introduction to the *Kedushah,* which is set to either *Et Sha-arei Ratzon* or *Ahot Ketannah. The pizmon Yah Shema Ebyonekha,* with its own traditional melody, introduces the *sefihot* which close the afternoon service. (No doubt the appearance of the “new” tune at this point is a refreshing tonic to the ears of the weary worshippers.)

Example 10

---

36. “In the heavenly heights,” once thought to have been written by Halevi, is now attributed to Joseph ibn Abitur. The second hymn which introduces the *Kedushah, Eretz Hitmotetah* (“Earth quivered and quaked”), is a genuine work of Halevi’s, but it is no longer sung in the service.

37. “The Mount of Zion,” is a piyyut by ibn Gabirol.

38. “Israel, Thy servants.” is a hymn of unknown authorship. The English congregations sing this to the *Adonai Bekol Shofar* melody.

39. “Angels on high,” is by an anonymous poet.
For the **Neilah**, or closing service, unique to this holiday alone, the symbolic closing of the gates of heaven is reflected in the much-loved pizmon El Nora Alilah, another rare example during this holiday season of a poetic piece having its own indivisible musical setting. In the repetition of the silent Amidah there are two poems to introduce the Kedushah by Abraham ibn Ezra. The first of these, Erelim Ve-Hashmalim is sung to the Adonai Bekol Shofar melody. As the sunset approaches, the confessions are shortened, as are the numbers of the selihot. The final piyyut, Shebet Yehudah, is a supplication pleading for God’s protection for his suffering people and is recited only today.

In the event Habdalah takes place in the synagogue, rather than in the home (that is, if Yom Kippur should occur on the Sabbath), the hymn Ha-Mabdil Ben Kodesh Lekhol is sung, adapted to the melody used earlier in the day for Yah Shema Ebyonekha. Clearly, the musico-poetic

---

40. **All Sephardic rituals have the** Neilah service ushered in with the singing of this well-known hymn, and it has many musical variants, although there is a distinct prototype to be found in all the tunes. It is of interest also that the hymn was retained in many of the congregations who abandoned the Sephardic Minhag, such as Savannah, Curacao, etc.

41. “Angels bright and angels strong,” is the first of the two poems by Abraham ibn Ezra; the second is Emet Bisfarekha (“The truth in Thy Books”), much shorter and more subdued and not sung any more.

42. “Still is Judah’s tribe,” by the anonymous poet Shemaiah. In London this is chanted very slowly as befitting the mood of solemnity at the end of the long day.

43. “May He who maketh a distinction between things sacred and profane” exists in two versions, both probably by the same poet, Isaac ben Judah ibn Ghayyat. In both the refrain begins with the same words. One is for Sabbath, the other, shorter variant was probably composed for the Neilah service on Yom Kippur. It has been the custom in Amsterdam to sing that version immediately preceding the reading of Shebet Yehuda.

44. This is the custom in Amsterdam, London, New York, Philadelphia, and Montreal. The only community that I have found to follow another tradition was that of the Comtat Venaissin in France, who sang Ha-Mabdil to the melody of El Nora Alilah. However, since that community is no longer viable, further inquiry into current practice is not possible.
liturgical traditions shared by the Dutch and English branches in the Sephardic Diaspora have remained strong and only slightly changed or eroded over the period of several centuries. Differences, when they do occur, seem to point more to a lessening of interest or involvement in congregational singing—a phenomenon certainly not peculiar to modern Jewish (or non-Jewish) communities alone. Many people today simply do not want to, or feel they cannot sing in chorus, and the custom of domestic music, personified by the image of a cozy group gathered around the family piano, has all but vanished into the realm of history. More than ever, congregations today wish the hazzan *not only* to lead them into the musical portions of the service, but to relieve them of much of the responsibility for its performance. As in the past, the community expects to be inspired and uplifted by the hazzan’s beautiful singing, musicianship and taste, as well as the sincere expression of his or her religious insight.

It is this writer’s belief that, in some instances the more things change, the more they stay the same. Perhaps it was the desire to fulfill the congregation’s needs that prompted the efflorescence of poetry and music which constitutes such a revered treasure among the Sephardim. But it is also possible for all Jews to share this magnificent treasure and so it is this writer’s hope that, in time, some of the lovely poetry and melodies discussed in the above pages will find their way into new homes, where they will be readily adopted and services immeasurably enhanced.
RECOLLECTIONS OF EARLY YEARS OF THE CANTORS ASSEMBLY WEST COAST REGION 1947-1956

JULIUS BLACKMAN

My first exposure (or near exposure) to a cantorial organization came in 1946 when my then cantorial teacher-now my dear friend and colleague Josef Roman Cycowski-had me drop him off, after a lesson, at the home of one of the hazzanim of the Jewish Ministers Cantors Association of California (the Hazzanim Farband) located in Los Angeles. He expected to see Cantor Paul Discount, Cantor Solomon Ancis, Cantor Itsikel Schiff, Jacob Weinstock (a conductor of Jewish choirs) and others.

Subsequently, in 1947, I met some of these and many others as I took my first full-time pulpit at the Valley Jewish Community Center (now Adat Ari El in North Hollywood). Particularly, I cherish my association through this pulpit with Paul Discount, cantor, composer, friend, and advisor, and one of the sweetest human beings I have known.

With the encouragement of Hazzanim Cycowski and Discount, in 1946 I became a member of the Jewish Ministers Cantors Association. This group included mostly orthodox hazzanim, though there were several Conservative and even one Reform cantor in the organization. Joining with me was a good friend, Cantor Nathan Katzman.

Cantor Katzman and I both were active in the Jewish Ministers Cantors group-he was one of the vice-presidents. I became Financial Secretary and Treasurer.

Nate and I were the “youngsters” of the group, with ambivalent feelings about it. We respected and admired our senior colleagues, yet at the same time we chafed at what we considered outmoded ideas and practices.

One accomplishment I recall, with some pride, was a dinner which I chaired and Nate served as co-chair. At this dinner, planned during Jewish Music Month, to honor Hazzanut, we prevailed on rabbis in the forefront of the three main wings of Jewish religious expression to pay tribute to our profession. The three were Rabbi Jacob Kohn of Temple Sinai, a leading synagogue in the Conservative movement; Rabbi Soloman Neches of the Western Jewish Institute, a large Orthodox

JULIUS BLACKMAN is a retired Hazzan in San Francisco, California
Orthodox Synagogue; and Dr. Max Nussbaum, senior rabbi at one of the largest Reform congregations in the area, Temple Israel of Hollywood. This was early in 1947.

Soon after, Cantor Katzman and I decided that we should involve ourselves in the just-formed Cantors Assembly. At that time, the CA there had three members: Carl Urstein, whose death this year saddened all of us, Nate Katzman, and myself. I became the president for the newly-formed group of the Cantors Assembly, Nate was vice-president and Carl was Secretary. We grew from those very tiny beginnings. By the time I left the presidency in 1956, we had grown to 20 or so.

We decided early on to associate the Cantors Assembly closely with the conservative movement and the University of Judaism, the West Coast arm of the Jewish Theological Seminary. We made it a point to participate actively in the United Synagogue region. In fact, I was made a member of the Regional Board of the United Synagogues, and of the Board of Governors of UJ. I must emphasize that we had to fight for this recognition, but would add also that the fact of our active participation in regional activities on a steady ongoing basis made it easier for the president of the Cantors Assembly for the region to become automatically a member of these Boards, as a matter of policy.

In those earlier years, as the Conservative movement grew rapidly in Los Angeles, so too did membership of the Assembly. Cantor Abe Salkov of the Olympic Temple (now Beth Am) joined us, as later did Allan Michelson, who also passed away this year. Also Cantor Cycowski, then in San Francisco at Beth Israel; Vittorio Weinberg of Beth Sholom in San Francisco; Leon Bennett in Los Angeles; Hy Hammerman, Sam Fordis, and numerous others.

To establish our role, we also participated jointly with the Rabbinical Assembly in United Synagogue activities: for a number of years, the United Synagogue held regional weekend conferences, with one of the larger congregations hosting a United Synagogue Sabbath Eve service, in which Rabbis and Cantors participated. Usually, a host Rabbi—or occasionally a seminary professor—delivered a sermon. The host cantor usually made Kiddush and/or whatever other prayer he preferred. The other Hazzanim formed the ensemble for all the other settings, with different Hazzanim doing solos in setting of Ma Tovu, L’chu Neran’nah, Hashkivenu, V’shamru, etc. In 1955, as an outgrowth of our active participation in United Synagogue and University of Judaism programs and endeavors, and a good working relationship with the Rabbinical Assembly, we were invited by Rabbi Max Vorspan of the RA to participate in what at that time was an annual Rabbinical retreat, this one at the Arrowhead Springs Hotel below Lake Arrowhead. We accepted and
joined our rabbinical colleagues for that retreat. Scholars in residence for this were Dr. Mordecai Kaplan and Dr. Jacob Kohn. We had the chance to participate in the sessions, which we found illuminating, and which gave us a better glimpse of the communal concerns of our rabbis. The experiences of that retreat also helped develop a better understanding and rapport among the rabbis and cantors. I know of no other similar occasion before or since. I was honored by being asked to chant the El Molei at a special memorial service for a Rabbi Lieberman, a professor at the seminary who had died during the time we were there. In all, some 11 or 12 of our colleagues participated in this retreat.

In 1956, for the United Synagogue’s Annual Regional Conference, I was asked to chair the Saturday Evening Program Committee. We decided to have a kind of Melave Malke program rather than another speaker. I was asked to write a cantata which could dramatize in narrative and music the concepts inherent in Shabbat observance. We called it “And on the Seventh Day.”

We involved the cantors in this cantata. As a matter of fact, practically the entire production was done by the cantors. The cantata was directed by Nathan Katzman, lights and sets were under the aegis of David Dam. In addition, cantors Abe Salkov, Leon Bennett, Sam Fordis, Herman (Hy) Hammerman, and Bob Roth participated. Ben Lax, past-president of the United Synagogue Region and Leo Simon, who also was active in United Synagogue Region were the narrators, and I was in charge of the production.

The cantata was a smash hit. As a matter of fact it was selected to represent the Jewish music idiom some months later at a “Brotherhood in Music” concert sponsored by Los Angeles’ Jewish Community Centers. This concert was presented at the Wilshire-Ebell Auditorium and featured ensembles from University of Judaism, and several others, with the Cantors Assembly members participating on behalf of the University of Judaism.

In other aspects of these United Synagogue weekends and indeed any United Synagogue events, it became a tradition that the Birkat Hamazon at all meals be led by a cantor-and some of the sessions at these conferences involved hazzanim chairing sessions and/or leading discussions on aspects of liturgy, developing activity groups such as choirs and music councils, etc.

Also, as part of our efforts to establish ourselves-and hazzanut—as integral parts of the Conservative movement, when our individual members arranged Jewish music concert in their synagogues, we provided a cantorial ensemble to help make these occasions more meaningful and attractive. We made it a point to highlight whichever cantor was the host.
He conducted the ensemble; he had the feature spots in the choral settings—
and one of us, usually the chairman, made it a point just after intermission to
pay *tribute to the fine Sheliach Tsiw* of that congregation, and to his
place as a luminary in the cantorial firmament of our community. All
proceeds—if there was a charge—went to the congregation. The only
expenses we charged were for an accompanist.

When a new cantor came to town, we tried to arrange an
appropriate *Baruch Habba*’d preferably in his congregation, at which a
representative of the Assembly spoke.

We recorded some other achievements as well . . .

We were able to convince the University of Judaism to be more
creative with their program. In those early days (1947 through 1953), the
UJ Music curriculum consisted of (A) a “class” on synagogue music, at
which some eight or ten volunteers learned some choral settings; and (B)
a “class” on Jewish music which focused on such Jewish composers as
Mendelssohn and Bloch.

We *persuaded* the UJ to set up a Jewish Music Council on which
the Assembly was represented and which comprised some of the finest
Jewish composers and instrumentalists.

The council, under the aegis of the University of Judaism,
presented two concerts in 1953 and 1954. Each *concert* presented a
world premiere in the “Jewish idiom.” The first was a cantata “The Queen of
Sheba” for contralto and eleven women, conducted by Dr. Hugo Strelitzer,
then conductor of the Hollywood Bowl chorus, with composer Mario
Castelnuevo-Tedesco at the piano. This was a 12-minute cantata. To fill
out the program, we presented the American Arts Quartet in a series of
vignettes by Joseph Achron, and Prokofieff’s Overture on a Hebrew
Theme.

The most enthusiastically received item on the program was the
performance by a Cantors Assembly ensemble presenting Yiddish and
Hebrew folk and art songs and liturgical settings.

In 1954, this Jewish Music Council again presented a world
premiere, this time of a work by Ernst Toch. This was “Vanity of Vanities”
for small string and wind ensemble with tenor and soprano solo. This was
a 15-minute work.

Again, to fill out the program, we added a piano quintet with
music by established Jewish composers and again, the most vigorous
acclaim greeted the *Cantors Assembly* ensemble. I should mention that the
Tedesco work was published (by Transcontinental). I still have the
manuscript for the Toch work.

By this time, our region had grown to include cantors from
Phoenix, San Diego, San Francisco, Seattle, Oakland, in addition to the
greater Los Angeles area.

We also established or began a close working relationship with the Reform cantors in Southern California. Among these cantors were Edward Krawall, Baruch Cohon, Saul Silverman and others.

After much discussion, we were able to persuade the University of Judaism to provide “in-service” courses for cantors on pulpits. The University was loathe to establish these courses, but eventually they agreed to two such courses. One, taught by Hazzan Leib Glantz, was a musical evaluation of Nusach Hat'filah. Only established Hazzanim were admitted to this course or the second one. The second course was a “master class” on the role and function of a modern cantor within the Conservative movement. This course was led by Cantor Nathan Katzman of Beth El and by me (at that time at Beth Zion). Some 12 to 14 cantors attended these courses.

In 1955 there was a Boy Scout World Jamboree held at Irvine, California (this was before California State University was built there). These Jamborees involve scouts from all over the world. One of the features of this jamboree was the three religious services; for Catholics, Protestants, and Jews. Vice-President Richard Nixon spoke briefly at each of these. For the Jewish service, two J.W.B. rabbis participated. I was asked to officiate and persuaded the J.W.B. that we could involve several other cantors. We had cantors Leon Bennett, Bob Roth, and Sid Bloom join me in the religious service, involving Jewish Scouts from across the U.S. and Canada, England, Australia, South America, and South Africa, to mention just those that come to mind.

In all, the Assembly grew from the original three members in 1947 to more than 20 by 1956, from a small enclave of mostly European-born cantors to a significant group of young, American-born hazzanim who began to develop a more modern approach to our ancient and hallowed profession. We have come a long way since those early days. The May 1991 national convention of the Cantors Assembly in Los Angeles truly was a remarkable and significant step forward.

I am proud that we who “worked in the Assembly vineyards” in those days when there were very scant and rare vineyards can look back on our role in providing a foundation on which our talented and dedicated young colleagues are building and expanding.
MUSIC REVIEW
THE GOLDEN AGE OF CANTORS - MUSICAL MASTERPIECES OF THE SYNAGOGUE
Edited by Velvel Pastemak and Noah Schall, with an Introduction by Irene Heskes.

Reviewed By ROBERT S. SCHERR

When overcome with gratitude, our tradition has said, “Dayenu!” Thus. . . if Irene Heskes, noted musicologist, had only written her essay “The Golden Age of Cantorial Artistry, Dayenu, we would be grateful for this publication. If Noah Schall, a treasured expert on hazzanim and hazzanut, had only assembled over two dozen of the greatest compositions in the repertoire of hazzanut, Dayenu. If Velvel Pasternak had only compiled a sensational cassette of our greatest voices singing their own material, Duyenu. The Golden Age of Cantors, just published by Tara Publications, is itself truly golden.

Irene Heskes, in seven concise and articulate pages, covers the history of hazzanut, placing it in the context of Jewish musical and communal development. Heskes’ essay traces the office and role of the hazzan, from the early Middle Ages, through Sulzer, through the era of the great voices presented in this volume, to the modern era and the challenge of incorporating our past into our present. Her beautiful conclusion bears repeating:

Thus, the true hazzan would give forth with heart and soul at the moment of intonation, in the absolute trust that the more one created music in prayer, the more creativity one could call forth from within. The vessel would simply never be emptied by its use.

The inclusion of brief biographical material makes this a small encyclopedia of hazzanut, valued as a program tool, both for repertoire and concert program notes.

In the forward, Pastemak carefully explains that this volume is in no way a complete presentation, either of the particular masters or the age. Rather, it is a sampling of some of the great hazzanim of that turn-of-the-century era, displaying their craft

ROBERT SCHERR serves as Hazzan of Temple Israel of Natick, Massachusetts. He is review editor of the Journal of Synagogue Music.
Every one of the twenty-seven recitatives contained here is a gem. They are not only pieces for which these great artists are famed—Rappaport’s Elu D’vorim or Pinchik’s Elohai N’ Shomo-but pieces which were themselves classic examples of hazzanut: Steinberg’s Birchas Hahalel Hate Elohai Ozn’cho by Israel Schorr, Shomea Kol Bichyos by Kapov-Kagan, and Vigoda’s Moron Di Vishmayo.

Some settings, such as Kwartin’s V’al Y’dei Avodecho, Elu D’varim by Koussevitsky, or Ato Chonen by Man&l, include keyboard accompaniment. Some accompaniments are “originals,” (e.g. Leo Low’s for Kwartin’s V’al Y’del), while others have Morris Barash’s arrangements. Chagy’s Birchas Kohanim even has a choral arrangement. David Koussevitsky’s V’chol Hachayim, and Av Horachamin by Leib Glantz, among others, appear with only the vocal line. Malavsky’s Shomea Kol Bichyos indicates that it was abridged and edited, apparently by Schall (though the publisher does not make that specifically clear).

So why is this anthology different from all other anthologies? Because it comes with a beautifully edited (cleaned of almost all the 78 rpm noise and hiss) cassette of the famed artists singing their own compositions. The cassette presents David Roitman singing his L’dovid Mizmor and Gershon Sirota singing Shome’a Vatismach Tsiyon and Israel Alter singing his Yo Ribon. The cassette, accompanying the anthology, is a significant achievement. Notes on the page, transcribing a hazzanic recitative, are only part of the story. While Noah Schall has superbly edited the transcriptions (and we are told when a recording, Moshe Koussevitsky’s Elu D’varim, is a performance which differs from the written composition), notes on a page are not “hazzanus.” Hearing the performances by the masters themselves illumines the printed page. For a lover of hazzanut, having the two together is extraordinary. For the professional hazzan who would add these pieces to his/her repertoire, the tape is a great learning aid. While an individual artist is free to interpret Karniol’s T’vienu El HarKodshecha, it is good to hear and understand what Karniol himself had in mind. To learn from the original form is an essential lesson in hazzanic interpretation.

Velvel Pastemak, whose publications are a pillar of Jewish musical life today, has truly created a “star” publication in The Golden Age. This is a volume which becomes the cornerstone of a library of hazzanic recitatives. The book and tape together allow both the intellect-through biographical material and the printed composition, and the imagination of our ears and souls-through the sounds of the hazzanim themselves, to respond together to these great masters and their work. And isn’t that melding of the intellect and the soul what the hazzanic art is to the prayer texts of our heritage?
On second thought, maybe we shouldn’t say "Dayenu" for this publication. Maybe we should say, Nu, Pasternak, when will Tam publish The Golden Age, Volume II?

YAMIM NORAIM, VOLUMES I AND II
Edited by Samuel Adler

Reviewed By Murray E. Simon

Transcontinental Music Publications, under the stewardship of Dr. Judith Tischler, has again performed an immeasurable service for cantors and professional Jewish musicians by publishing their beautifully bound, two volume compendium entitled Yamim Noraim, musical settings of the liturgy for the High Holy Days for cantor, choir and organ. Edited by Dr. Samuel Adler, this valuable edition is a reworking of an earlier anthology compiled and edited by Prof. Adler and published by Transcontinental in 1972. The selections offered in the earlier work were geared to the liturgy in the Nigh Holy Day Union Prayer Book of the Reform movement. The second edition was motivated by the emergence of the New Reform High Holy Day Prayer Book, Gates of Repentance, which incorporates many more of the traditional prayers of the High Holy Day liturgy. This dictated a need for a more comprehensive collection of musical settings than was offered previously.

The following quotation from the preface by Dr. Adler presents the philosophical thrust of the editor and, hence, reflects the tenor of these newer volumes.

Too often Jewish music, especially on solemn occasions, has been made synonymous with slow and tearful sounds. The music in these services will dispel this erroneous convention. Traditional modes, motives, ending patterns and moods have been judiciously employed throughout and new harmonizations of chance are offered here.....The High Holy day literature is a rich and ennobling and exceedingly strong collection of prayers. It is arranged to form a profound drama from solemnity through contrition, confession, remembrance, to conviction and hope for a new and more meaningful life in the year to come. To serve as the handmaid to this overwhelming human involvement with the self, as well as the Eternal in life, the music is created to clarify and enhance the words spoken and felt.

Murray E. Simon is Cantor of Temple Reyim of Newton, Massachusetts. Past president of the American Conference of Cantors, he is also the producer of the historic video, "Great Cantors of the Golden Age."
In my opinion, the musical settings offered in Yamim Noraim have nobly carried out this intention.

The Rosh HaShannah volume was printed first in August 1990 and contains 79 musical settings, while the Yom Kippur volume, printed in February 1991 contains 81 settings. Unlike the original 1972 work, these volumes present alternative musical approaches to the same prayer. Usually one setting is more “traditional” in sound and the other, by such contemporary composers as Samuel Adler, Ben Steinberg, Michael Isaacson, Aminadav Aloni reflects more of a “minhag America” style. In general, both settings are very effective and may be alternated to offer variety in the texture of the service. Some congregations have adopted the custom of offering a more “contemporary” service on the second day of Rosh HaShannah. Thus, the inclusion of settings by living composers is most welcome.

Because there are settings of prayers which are common to both, the Table of Contents lists the corresponding page numbers of the prayers to be found in both the Reform Gates of Repentance and the Conservative Rabbinical Assembly Mahzor. In terms of its usage, Yamim Noraim is primarily for reference. After selecting the desired musical settings in the anthology, one consults the individual catalogue number which is provided in the Table of Contents next to the prayer listing so that performance editions may be ordered. Transcontinental will provide a price list of the individual settings after the anthology has been purchased ($40.00 for the two volumes). There is also a separate organ edition available for $10.00 which contains larger print and additional organ pieces as a supplement to the familiar Lewandowski preludes for Rosh HaShannah and Yom Kippur which open both volumes.

The following caveat is offered in both volumes. “Please note that the Hebrew text has been changed throughout to modern Sephardic transliterations, although word accents have remained as in the original versions.” According to Judith Tischler, the cost of resetting all of the texts to put them in their proper accentuation would have been prohibitive. It is up to each individual cantor or music director, therefore, to see to it that the proper adjustments are made.

Yumim Noraim is not the same as the Ephros anthology. It is a very successful attempt to offer a more contemporary, more suitable collection of musical materials for the High Holy Days for American congregations, both Conservative and Reform. Journal readers should be grateful for the generosity of the American Conference of Cantors and its individual members, who made the publication of Yamim Noraim possible, and especially to the expertise of Dr. Samuel Adler, editor, and
Transcontinental Music Publications, publisher, for this monumental musical resource. This work is a must for every Jewish music library.